The following is a transcript of a PBS (Public Broadcasting Services) documentary by Steve Pressman entitled *Holy Silence*, 2020.

Holy Silence

CAPTION: "Who knows if the Church could have done more during the Holocaust? We must seek the truth." —Pope Francis.

DAVID KERTZER (author of *The Pope and Mussolini*): How could it be that the people of Europe would see the Jews in such demonic terms that they would massacre children and old people. For that, I think, the church bears great responsibility.

(FATHER) NORBERT HOFFMANN: The Nazis were here in Rome at the gates of his palace. He was prisoner in the Vatican. What can you do as a prisoner? You can only hope and pray.

(FATHER) CHARLES GALLAGHER (author, *Vatican Secret Diplomacy*): America is becoming a very important player on the International scene. And the Vatican is seen as a moral voice, which could be used against Nazi Germany.

PETER EISNER (author, *The Pope's Last Crusade*): The Pope was preparing to challenge Hitler and the entire concept of antisemitism. He summoned a humble Jesuit from the United States.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING (author, *The Holocaust and Catholic Silence*): The pope has come to symbolize a moral test for the Catholic Church during World War II. What is the point of a religion, what is the role of the Catholic Church? And it's a question for all time.

TITLE: *Holy Silence*. A film by Steve Pressman.

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "Catholics in Reich Expect Nazi Blow."

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "Reich Strikes at Catholics; Rules Attacks by Priests are Assault on Nazi State."

DAVID KERTZER (author of *The Pope and Mussolini*): It's hard to date the origins of what happened with the Vatican and the Holocaust. But 1922 was a key year because Pius XI becomes pope. And he will be pope over the next two decades in the years that will lead up to the Holocaust.

In Italy itself the Fascist Movement is gaining ground, and later that same year is when Benito Mussolini would come to power. Fascism did not begin as an antisemitic movement, so in that sense it was very different than Nazism and National Socilaism in Germany. Among the early Fascists were quite a few Jews, who saw it as a sort of nationalist, patriotic, anti-Communist movement.

You had Jewish-Fascist mayors. You had Jews fairly high up in the Fascist party.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI (author, *Under His Very Window: The Vatican and the Holocaust in Italy*): Pius XI, almost immediately, saw an opportunity to deal with a figure who he belived had control of the political system.

DAVID KERTZER: The Pope himself said that God chooses strange instruments. And Mussolini certainly is very strange as God's instrument. Mussolini was a big bully, a violent man, not a religious bone in his body. But this is how the Pope saw things.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: The two of them worked together to, eventually, a concordat in 1929. Which did many things to change the course of Italian-Vatican relations.

DAVID KERTZER: The Concordat is a treaty that establishes

Vatican City as a sovereign entity. Vatican City did not exist beforehand.

Pope Pius XI appoints his new secretary of state, Eugenio Pacelli, who is number two in the Vatican after the Pope himself.

ROBERT VENTRESCA (author, *Soldier of Christ: The Life of Pope Pius XII*): Eugenio Pacelli really cuts his diplomatic teeth in Germany in that immediate Post-First World War period when he serves in Germany as the papal representative. There's no question that he develops a fondness for the German language, German people. He develops, most importantly, a familiarity with the reality of German politics.

MICHAEL PHAYER (Emeritus Professor of History, Marquette University): His fixation on Communism was rooted way back in his early career, when the Communist tried, did take over Munich. And he was threatened with his life at that point.

DAVID KERTZER: Pacelli was a man with deep knowledge of the world political situation. Pius XI had much less sophistication. He was someone that if he felt Church values were threatened would, could erupt. Pacelli was not like that. He was someone very much in control of himself. The Pope came to rely on Pacelli, especially in dealing with German affairs because of Pacelli's deep experience with Germany.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING (author, *The Holocaust and Catholic Conscience*): As the vote for Adolph Hitler is growing, Pacelli is receiving letters from German Catholics saying, "I want to be Catholic, and I want to be a Nazi. Please take a clear stand. Please ask Pius XI to take a clear stand. Please advise me."

There are fascinating internal documents between Pacelli, as secretary of state, and bishops in Germany, discussing this. "Do we risk alienating Catholics who want to remain in the Church and are attracted to Nazism? How do we handle this problem?"

DAVID KERTZER: Hitler comes to power in January 19333, and

very quickly, within just six months, Pacelli negotiated a concordat, a treaty between the Vatican and the Nazi regime in Germany.

MICHAEL PHAYER: Even though it got broken before it was even signed, they thought it was the right thing to do.

DAVID KERTZER: It was certainly not that he had sympathy with National Socialism, but Pacelli was concerned that if the Pope did anything to upset Hitler, especially publically, it might threaten some of the privileges that the Roman Catholic Church still had in Germany.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING: The first anti-Jewish laws were in 1933. Pacelli, as secretary of state, took a position of neutrality. "Let German Bishops make their decisions. We, here in Rome, I, as secretary of state; I am going to try to remain above the fray."

NORBERT HOFMANN (Vatican Commission for Jewish Relations): In Nazi Germany, not only the Jews were persecuted. They were killed, yes. But also the Church, the Catholic Church, were really persecuted. Murdered priests. The goal of the Nazis was also to eliminate, to murder the Church. Because they felt that they are the redeemers, the Nazis. They didn't want to have a religion.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING: At the onset, the first anti-Jewish laws, many letters were coming to the Vatican from Jews saying, "Help me. Please give some kind of response that will be heard by the millions of Roman Catholics in the world and by a regime that had a 30% Catholic population."

DAVID KERTZER: Pius XI grew up in a Church that had very hostile views toward the Jews. His own relationship with the Jews was not one of hostility, but he did share in some of these larger antisemitic views that were prevalent at the time in the Church.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING: One letter came to Pope Pius XI from a rabbi in Vienna. Rabbi Swartz and Pope Pius XI had been great friends. Very intellectually connected. And had on many occasions exchanged ideas. Rabbi Swartz asked, "Can the Pope speak out on behalf of our friendship, on behalf of Jews like me?" And we think that Pacelli, as secretary of state, never even showed Rabbi Swartz' letter to Pope Pius XI.

(FATHER) CHARLES GALLAGHER (author, *Vatican Secret Diplomacy*): As the United States rises as a world power so too do the American Catholics. And it's an extraordinary rise. By the mid-1930s, Catholics are approaching one-fifth of the population of the United States. Prior to this in the nineteenth and early twentieth century, many Catholics were looked down upon and even persecuted.

MARIA MAZZENGA (Curator and History Instructor Catholic University of America): Rooselvelt tapped into this population, spoke to the needs of immigrant Catholics and ethnic Catholics of this time. Before that, they were kind of ignored by both Republicans and Democrats.

(FATHER) GERELD FOGARTY (Professor, History of Christianity, University of Virginia): Cardinal Pacelli, who was then secretary of state, visited the United States. His main purpose in coming whas that he wanted to meet Roosevelt. In the meantime, Pacelli had visited the country. They actually chartered a plan to fly him out to the West Coast.

EVAN STEWART (Adjunct Professor of Law, Fordham University): Pacelli's visit in 1936 took place literally on the eve of the presidential election. So Rooselvelt wanted this well-known within the Catholic community that he was inviting the secretary of state of the Vatican, Pacelli, to the United States.

ROBERT VENTRESCA: What's really going on behind the scenes,

it appears, is that the Vatican and the United States are coming closer together than ever before in their history. And figures like Jospeh Kennedy, for example, instrumental in helping to introduce Pacelli to the world of FDR.

PETER EISNER (author, *The Pope's Last Crusade*): There was a famous argument that they had. Pacelli said, "The greatest challenge facing the United States is Communism." And Rooselvelt scoffed at Pacelli and said, "The great challenge is Fascism."

MARIA MAZZENGA: I'd be shocked if Coughlin's name did not come up at that time. Pacelli was so savvy. He would have known to bring it up.

(NEWSREEL) FATHER CHARLES COUGHLIN: I ask you in the name of Christianity, which abhores Communism; I ask you if you will rise in your places and pledge with me to restore America to the Americans.

MARIA MAZZENGA: Father Coughlin was a priest in Detroit. He was very much an advocate of the working man. He started his own radio program.

(FATHER) CHARLES GALLAGHER: Father Coughlin had 30,000,000 radio listeners. He is the most popular mass political figure on the scene, and one of the greatest public supporters of Franklin Delanor Rooselvelt.

In 1936, Father Coughlin is not brought into the inner circle of the newly elected Roosevelt administration. Father Coughlin calls the president "Franklin *Double-Crossing* Roosevelt." It was considered completely out-of-bounds, especially for a man of the cross. The Vatican is immediately made aware of this. They become disturbed that this priest is now becoming a political attack dog. And they become deeply concerned about relations with the United States.

MARIA MAZZENGA: After that, Coughlin becomes even more

vocal against Roosevelt. And he begins lacing his talks with antisemitism. His bishop at the time, Bishop Gallager, in Detroit, supported and protected Father Coughlin although he was making this antisemitic turn.

DAVID KERTZER: Pope Pius XI, who sees Hitler as an enemy of the Catholic Church, becomes more and more upset as Mussolini embraces Hitler. Initially Hitler sees Mussolini as a role model. But this relationship would alter as Hitler becomes more and more powerful. In 1938, Hitler would visit Rome. The Pope would not stay in Rome for that visit, but would go to his summer estate outside the city; closes down the Vatican.

It was a suprise to most Italians when the antisemitic measures were announced. For example, kicking all Jewish students out of the public schools. And firing all Jewish teachers and professors and all the civil servants.

There's a big debate whether Mussolini was antisemitic. A Jewish woman, Marguarita Sepharti, was his lover and mistress and perhaps his most important political counselor as he was coming to power. So I think most historians would see his move toward antisemitism as wanting to show Hitler that he was his equal.

ROBERT VENTRESCA: Pius XI begins to question whether it makes sense for the Vatican to continue to normalize its diplomatic relationship with the Hitler regime and with the Mussolini regime. And there are some very frank exchanges between Pius XI and Pacelli, his secretary of state.

Pacelli's response was characteristically Pacelli. It was to acknowledge the concern but to always ask the question, "What's the alternative?" In Pacelli's estimation, there were no good alternatives to that diplomatic relationship, as imperfect and controversial as it was.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: Pius XI said to a group of Belgian tourists, "Antisemitism is a hateful movement with which we Catholics must have nothing to do. Spiritually, we are all Semites."

DAVID KERTZER: If we're trying to understand the kind of objection that Pius XI faced, we can look far back and look at the roots of Catholic antisemitism and the demonization of the Jews by churchmen.

(FATHER) KEVIN SPICER, C.S.C. (author, *Hitler's Priests*): Negative teaching about Jews that originates from the earliest years of Christianity, where Jews are portrayed in a negative light, over the centuries as Jews were vilified, that vilification became intensified.

DAVID KERTZER: Pius XI began to feel it necessary to take a strong position denouncing racism, denouncing antisemitism. He strongly believed it was not only his job to protect the institutional interests of the Church but also to speak out on important moral questions. It was over the objection that Pacelli and others around the Pope put up that the Pope decided, "No, this is a matter of deep principle, deep Catholic values." He felt that the pope has an obligation to speak.

It was pretty clear, I think, to Pope Pius XI that if he tried to work through the normal channels in the Church, he'd be thwarted. He didn't even want to consult his own secretary of state. Pacelli didn't know initially this was happening. Pope Pius XI brings in what to the Vatican was a quite obscure American Jesuit, John LaFarge.

PETER EISNER: John LaFarge came from a blueblood-like family. John went to Harvard in the late 1800s, breezed through, and then came to his parents one day and said he wanted to be a priest. They were deeply shocked by that.

A family friend, none other than the Vice President of the United States at the time, Teddy Roosevelt, interceded saying, "The boy has a vocation, and he should become a priest." And he convinced them to allow that to happen.

LaFarge had his first great experience as a priest in St. Mary's County, Maryland, where he ministered to a very poor, predom-

inantly African American community. And it really changed his worldview, seeing the suffering and racism that the black folks in St. Mary's County suffered.

INSERT: (Book cover) *A Catholic Interracial Program* by John LaFarge S.J.

PETER EISNER: He wanted the Church to get more active than it had ever been in fighting racism. That, in turn, amazingly brought LaFarge's name to the desk of Pope Pius XI.

In the mid-1930s, Americans were not always necessarily focusing on the changes that were going on in Europe with the rise of Hitler and Nazism. By 1938, though, something terrible seemed to be happening. And John LaFarge, who was an associate editor at *America* Magazine, sailed to Europe in the spring of 1938 to get an idea about, as he said, whether the newspapers were telling it right.

DAVID KERTZER: This is one month after Hitler has paid very dramatic triumphal visit to Rome, to Napals, to Florence.

PETER EISNER: A day or two before LaFarge is supposed to leave Rome, suddenly a letter arrived at the residence with the tell-tale colors and insignia of the Vatican. He knew immediately that this was an invitation from the Pope himself.

After a sleepless night, LaFarge drove down to Casta Gondolpho—it's about an hour and a half drive on winding roads—and presented himself at the Papal Palace. When the elevator opened and Pacelli came out, Pacelli was kind of glaring at LaFarge. He wouldn't have known who he was necessarily. But he seemed to be not very happy. That was not a surprise because the Pope had cleared the room purposely to talk about something that he considered to be highly secret.

LaFarge, looking around, saw that a copy of his book *Interracial Justice* was on the Pope's desk. There was LaFarge expecting to be rebuked by the Pope for saying something that was too far out of bounds, too progressive. Then followed an almost humor-

ous interaction in which they tried to determine what language they were going to speak. The Pope read many languages and probably could speak some English, but they finally setted on French.

After a moment, the Pope got to the point that he wanted to discuss. That he was preparing himself to challenge Hitler, Nazism, Mussolini, and the entire concept of antisemitism. The same point which LaFarge had made in *Interracial Justice*. There's only one race and that's the human race. And, the Pope continued, John LaFarge will write this encyclical for me.

He was floored. How would a humble Jesuit from the United States do such a thing. That was where the Pope turned to him and said, (French first then translation) "Say it completely, simply. Say it as if you, yourself, were the pope."

LaFarge was supposed to be leaving Rome and coming home. So he immediately had to tell the editor of *America* magazine that something had changed. He wrote a long letter to his boss.

"Frankly, I am simply stunned. And all I can say is that the Rock of Peter has fallen on my head. Had I anticipated such a terrific development, nothing would have persuaded me even to go to Rome, much less see the Pope. As it is, nothing to do but go through with the whole thing . . ."

DAVID KERTZER: The encyclical is the most authoritative pronouncement that a pope can make. Unfortunately, Vladimir Ledóchowski, the head of the Jesuit Order at the time, is a virulent anti-Semite, and he's very upset when he learns, first of all, that the Pope is planning an encyclical denouncing antisemitism. And, secondly, that the Pope has called on a Jesuit, a member who's under his direction, to draft it.

PETER EISNER: LaFarge, in the summer of 1938, is in Paris. He is working at a feverish pace to try to produce an encyclical. Ledóchowski, every once in a while, is getting in touch. "How are you doing? What's going on?" A little bit too interested, perhaps, in finding out what was going on. And finally saying to LaFarge, "Well, if you're about finished, no need to come back to

Rome. Just give it to me, and I'll deliver it to the Pope." LaFarge didn't know if that was a good idea or not, but he finally gave in and said, "Well, I can trust my superior to deliver this."

The Pope, meanwhile, was expecting it to arrive and made some comments in the press that he had something major to say. LaFarge arrived in the United States a couple of weeks later, awaiting word, and things were quiet.

By late October, LaFarge was getting increasingly concerned that he's heard nothing about his encyclical draft, and he was starting to realize that something might be wrong. LaFarge decides to write a letter to the pope, saying, "I'm sure that you've received the encyclical from Father Ledóchowski because I gave it to him."

LaFarge delivers the letter to the Vatican representative in Washington, who assumedly sends it through in a diplomatic pouch to the Vatican. LaFarge finally hears that the Pope has been asking, "Where is the encyclical?"

Meanwhile, the Pope was ill a series of times throughout 1938. There are questions about whether his apparent heart condition will finally get bad enough so that he may not be able to function.

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "Nazis Smash, Loot and Burn Jewish Shops and Temples Until Goebbels Calls Halt."

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "Nazis Warn Foreign Press 'Lies' Will Hurt Reich Jews; Arrests Run to Thousands."

MARIA MAZZENGA: *Kristallnacht* was the pogrom against the Jews that took place in Germany on November 9th and 10th of 1938. Jewish shops were smashed, 30,000 Jews were deported and put in concentration camps, and Jews were widely attacked throughout Germany. It is considered the beginning of the Holocaust because it is the first time that you saw full-on, orchestrated violence against Jews as a select minority in Nazi

Germany under Hitler.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING: Pacelli is approached to intervene and make a public statement. At the time, because Pius XI was ill, Pacelli had a lot of decision-making power and instructed the response to be, "We can only make a general, neutral statement about all victims. We cannot speak out against the Nazi regime specifically and for Jews specifically." He will not use the word *Nazi*; he will not use the word *Jew*.

(FATHER) CHARLES GALLAGHER: In the United States through the 1930s, Father Coughlin is increasingly enveloping antisemitic commentary within his radio broadcasts. *Kristallnacht* prompts Coughlin to become explosively antisemitic, and he blames the Jews for their own persecution.

COUGHLIN RADIO BROADCAST, November 20, 1938: "It is the belief, be it well or ill founded, of the present German government that Jews were responsible for the economic and social ills suffered by the fatherland since the signing of the treaty of Versailles. Thus Nazism was conceived as a political defense mechanism against Communism. And Communism itself was regarded by the rising generation of Germans as a product not of Russia but of a group of Jews who dominated the destinies of Russia. These Jews were not religious Jews. They were the haters of God, the haters of religion. Thus througout Germany, antipathy toward all Jews grew rapidly."

(FATHER) KEVIN SPICER: In the minds of many churchmen, Jews were naturally predispositioned to Communism. It was also a picture and worldview that was created by Hitler.

(Father) Charles Gallagher: In 1938, Hitler gives a speech and mentions Father Coughlin. This Catholic priest from Detroit, he says, is the type of priest we should all be supporting.

MARIA MAZZENGA: Hitler had sympathizers in the United

States. Some Catholics thought thaat what he was doing was a good thing. Other American Catholics were horrified. Father Maurice Sheehy, who was a professor in the Religious Education Department here at Catholic University, organized an anti-Nazi broadcast.

CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY RADIO BROADCAST, November 16, 1938: "The world is witnessing a great tragedy in Europe today, and after sober, calm, reflection, various groups and leaders of the Catholic Church have sought permission to raise their voices, not in mad hysteria, but in firm indignation against the atrocities visited upon the Jews in Germany."

PETER EISNER: We know that the encyclical written by John LaFarge, the American Jesuit Priest, was on the Pope's desk in January of 1939. How it got there and whether the Pope had read it is not absolutely clear, but it is known through students who met with the pope, he had told them that he had something exciting planned, big changes, and they saw the pope, despite having been sick, to be quite vigorous and excited about what the prospects were.

The Pope convened all of Italian bishops to come to Rome. The Pope suddenly came down with a cold. He called in doctors, told the doctors keep him going, give him whatever they had to give him because he had to get through to that Saturaday to meet with the bishops. Whatever might have occurred, we don't know because the Pope died the day before, February 10, 1939.

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "German Envoy Urges Cardinals to Elect Pope Favoring Fascists."

DAVID KERTZER: The question of who would succeed Pius XI becomes very important to Mussolini and, to a lesser extent, to Hitler himself. We know from the diplomatic correspondence that both the Fascists, the Italian ambassador to the Holy See, and the German, or Nazi, ambassador to the Holy See meet to discuss what needs to be done. And they both agree that the man

who would most protect their interest would be Eugenio Pacelli. And so they scheme behind the scenes, meeting with the German and Italian cardinals to try to bolster their support.

NEWSREEL FOOTAGE AND AUDIO: "Outside St. Peters, Rome, they wait for news of the elction of the pope. Catholic men, women, and children waiting for a sign from the conclave. Then suddenly, after the third ballot, the white smoke from the Sistine Chapel. The pope has been elected, but who?

"Cardinal Eugenio Pacelli, papal secretary of state, is the choice of the cardinals. Elected on his sixty-third birthday, he has assumed the title of Pius XII and is likely to continue the policy of Pius XI.

DAVID KERTZER: Pius XII decides that the encyclical is a bad idea. It will both increase tensions both with the Fascist regime in Italy and with the Nazi regime in Germany.

PETER EISNER: One of the first things that Pacelli did was to say to his subordinates, "Gather up all versions of these documents, and they must be destroyed. Not a letter should remain."

He did meet with Ledóchowski and made it clear that this draft of an encyclical would not be known as an encyclical and would never be referred to as an encyclical. And with that happening, it was clear to LaFarge that that chapter in history had been closed and was sealed.

Pope Pius XI's attempt to challenge Nazism, to challenge Fascism in Italy, and to challenge antisemitism would never appear in that form ever again.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING: From what we know of very radical Nazis at the highest levels, they were going to do what they were going to do, no matter what anyone said. I'm not sure anything a pope or another head of state would say would necessarily sway them in the way we would like.

I'm thinking here about those 21,000,000 Catholics who had to cooperate and support the Nazi regime for it to function on

a day-to-day level. They might have behaved differently. Maybe they would have sheltered a Jewish family. Maybe they would have responded differently to an order on the field of battle. Maybe they would have responded differently to their Nazi thug in their neighborhood that they tried to avoid and ignore rather than speak up against. Maybe they would have behaved differently when their own church was being attacked.

EVAN STEWART: With everything that's happening in Europe, we're pulling not just our German ambassador out, but we're having no one left in Europe, so one of the considerations in Roosevelt's mind is, we need someone over there who can tell us what's going on.

DAVID KERTZER: FDR decided, with Pacelli becoming pope, a man whom he had met in the United States, it would be wise to have a kind of go-between between himself and the Pope.

EVAN STEWART: Roosevelt sits down and writes a handwritten letter to the Pope.

(ACTOR VO) FDR: "February 14, 1940. Your Holiness, I am entrusting this special mission to Mr. Myron Taylor, who is a very old friend of mine and in whom I repose the utmost confidence. I shall be happy to feel that he may be the channel of communications for any views you and I may wish to exchange in the interest of concord among the peoples of the world. Cordially your friend, Franklin D. Roosevelt.

EVAN STEWART: Myron Taylor is probably the country's leading industrialist of the first half of the twentieth century. In the early 1920s his friend JP Morgan begs him to save US Steel. He then takes US Steel through the Depression. And he says, "Okay, that work is now done. I now want to retire. Then a couple of weeks later, Frankilin Roosevelt calls him and says, "I want you to take on an assignment for me."

(FATHER) CHARLES GALLAGHER: Even though Myron Taylor is not a Catholic, he is speaking to the Vicar of Christ as a representative of the president of the United States.

EVAN STEWART: Taylor brought a very quiet diplomacy to that process. He also had a personal relationship not just with people in the Vatican, because Taylor had this fabulous villa in Tuscany, so he had spent a lot of time in Italy, knew all the people in Europe.

On Taylor's first visit in 1940, the initial instructions are to try to prevent a greater outbreak of the war. "Try to use all of your best efforts to get the Pope to keep Mussolini from joining the war." That mission does not succeed. The Pope's reaction is, "I really have no authority, moral or other authority, to convince Mussolini to do anything."

BARCLAY TITTMANN: My father had a wonderful career in the foreign service. He was assigned to Rome for eleven years. And because of his long experience in Italy, he was assigned to be the assistant to Myron Taylor. That was the beginning of his career at the Vatican City.

(Reading from the *Memoirs of Harold Tittmann*, Barclay's father): "One of the consequences of living in Vatican City was, of course, that of being close with the Holy Father. A few times, I was invited to bring along my wife and two sons."

The Americans had as their goal to get the pope to be specifically in favor of the Allies. My father had a lot to do with that. But the Pope never gave in on that. He wanted to keep his neutrality.

MICHAEL PHAYER: Pius XII did not think that the Allies would win World War II. He thought that there would be a negotiated peace, and it would leave the Nazis in power in much of Europe. He doesn't speak out against the Nazis. That was his attempt to stay on the safe side, to thread the needle.

(ACTOR VO) POPE PIUS XII, Letter to President Franklin D. Roosevelt: "Dear Mr. President, as Vicar on Earth of the Prince

of Peace, we have dedicated our efforts and our solicitude to the pupose of maintaining peace, and afterwards, of reestablishing it. Heedless of momentary lack of success and of the difficulties involved, we are continuing to follow along the path marked out for us by our apostolic mission.

EVAN STEWART: Pearl Harbor happens. We declare war against Japan. Italy and the Nazis declare war on us. So we are at war with three different countries. Roosevelt wants Taylor to go to the Vatican again.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: Pius XII hoped very much that he could remain neutral in the war and that he could help negotiate a peace. He felt that that would be his major contribution.

EVAN STEWART: Roosevelt sends Taylor over principally to talk the pope into not doing this, thatb that's a bad idea.

BARCLAY TITTMANN (reading from the *Memoirs of Harold Tittmann*, his father, Taylor's assistant): "I was now confronted with the problem of persuading the Holy See that the United States would never agree to a Nazi victory of any kind."

EVAN STEWART: One of the things that he arms the pope with, Taylor does, is his knowledge of the American war machine. "We are now turning out 10,000 tanks a week, 10,000 planes a week, and it's not a question of if we win the war, 'cause we are gonna crush these people with just the sheer weight of the war materiel that we make. The world is going to be a world that we are going to be leading because there\s just no way we can lose."

(ACTOR VO) FRANKLIN D. ROOSEVELT, Letter: "September 3, 1942. Your Holiness, I well know what great difficulties surround you. And I know that you are praying for us in the United States, just as you are praying from all humanity.

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "Two-Thirds of

Jews in Poland are Held Slain."

(ACTOR VO) POPE PIUS XII, Letter to President Roosevelt: "Dear Mr. President, Our heart is particularly saddened by the thought of the massacre and widespread devastation which the present conflict is leaving in its wake. We have not failed, and we shall not fail, to do everything possible to alleviate the sufferings of those in need and in carrying out this beneficent work of charity.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: There's very little disagreement on the issue of what the Pope knew because the documents are quite clear.

INSERT: (Extract of newspaper article): "ROME, March 7 -- The Vatican has been receiving copious amounts of documentation on the persecution of Jews in German-held Poland . . ."

DAVID KERTZER: Myron Taylor's mission was not principally about the Jews and the situation of the Jews, although this issue was raised.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: Pius XII had the equivalent of ambassadors in many different countries, including Germany, who brought back an enormous amount of information. Many of the reports have actually been signed, seen by the pope. The documents speak of 2,000,000 Jews having been killed.

(ACTOR VO) HAROLD TITTMANN, Diplomatic cable: "October 6, 1942. The Holy See is still apparently convinced that a forthright denunciation by the Pope of Nazi atrocities would only result in the violent deaths of many more people."

ROBERT VENTRESCA: The whole controversy around Pius XII, what we've come to call the *Pius War*, really centers around the question of what the Pope said or didn't say, especially when word begins to reach the Vatican of the mass deportaion of European Jews.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: The Pope made a Christmas message every year, which was broadcast over the radio. The Allied world was hoping very much that Pius XII would make a statement about the Jews in his Christmas message of 1942. In a long, long speech, he had one sentence about th sufferering of Jews.

POPE PIUS XII (VO actual radio address or reenactment?): "Hundreds of thousands of persons, without any fault on their part, sometimes only because of their nationality or race, have been consigned to death or to a slow decline."

MICHAEL PHAYER: To mention Germany, to explicitly mention Jews, in the Christmas message of 1942 would, in his mind, run the risk of a diplomatic break between the Vatican and Germany. And he would not do that. He would not take that risk.

DAVID KERTZER: During World War II, Pius XII came out with a number of messages of world peace and brotherhood and harmony, all of which, I'm sure, are praiseworthy sentiments. In all those pronouncements, however, he never mentioned the word *Jew*. He certainly never talks about the massacre of Jews that he knew was occurring by the millions. He never mentions the fact that thousands of people who saw themselves as good Catholics were taking part in the massacre of Jewish men, women, and children.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: There was nothing specific that would contravene the anti-Jewish sentiments in countries like Poland, like Eastern European countries, and other countries as well, unfortunately, to remind them of moral and spiritual obligations. I think that could have made a difference.

BARCLAY TITTMANN: Basically, it's pretty boring for a ten-year-old kid at the Vatican. Sit around in a place that has a nice garden but no other kids. And so the entertainment was provided by the bombings.

DAVID KERTZER: The Pope was very much concerned about Rome and especially Vatican City, being bombed by the Allies.

EVAN STEWART: This was a recurrent theme in his meetings with Myron Taylor, that, "Please convince Churchill and Roosevelt to not bring bombing runs over Rome. "You think you're hitting one part of Rome; you're gonna hit the Vatican. And this is irreplaceable."

(ACTOR VO) POPE PIUS XII, Letter to President Roosevelt: "July 19, 1943. My dear Mr. President, the neutrality of the Holy See strikes its roots deep in the very nature of our apostolic ministry. And now, even in Rome, we have had to witness the harrowing scene of death leaping from the skies, striking down women and children. A city whose every district has its irreplaceable monuments of faith or art, and Christian culture cannot be attacked without inflicting an incomparable loss on the patrimony of religion and civilization."

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: Mussolini had been removed from power in July of '43. The Germans occupied Italy, and Italy was no longer a partner of the Germans in the war but an occupied country. And until that time, Jews had not been deported. Everything changed for the Jews at that point.

Italian police and civil servants were asked to prepare lists of Jews thoughout the city of Rome. They certainly had strong suspicion that their lists were being prepared foe evil purposes. Many of those officials were practicing Catholics who didn't want to see the Jews deported and spoke to their priests. There was a network. It's hard to believe that that information did not reach the Pope, yet the Jews seem not to have been warned of the impending danger.

INSERT: (Contemporary newspaper headline) "Germans Round Up All Jews in Rome."

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: On October 16, 1943, Jews were caught unaware in their homes, and 1,259 individuals—men, women, and

children—were arrested and imprisoned in a mititary institution very close to Vatican City.

The Pope learned about the Rome roundup early in the morning of October 16th as it was happening. The pope contacted his secretary of state, Maglione. Maglione arranged a meeting with the German ambassador at the Holy See.

DAVID KERTZER: The German Ambassador, Ernst von Weizsacker, says to the cardinal, "Well, I understand your position, but do you really want me to tell that highest authority in Germany, who might be very unhappy if you were going to protest this?"

And Cardinal Maglione says, "Well, no, please don't do that. I'll leave that to your judgment."

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: The Pope did not protest. More than a thousand people were deported to Auschwitz on October 18th, two days later, and most of them were gassed upon arrival at Auschwitz. Hitler was certainly not about to change his mind because the pope made a statement after people had already been arrested. On the other hand, those victims might not have been sent to Auschwitz. Thery might have been sent somewhere else.

In Denmark, around the same time when the Jews were threatened with arrest, a German official warned them, as the pope might have done, and most of them hid. The Danish authorities continually appealed to the Germans: "Where are our citizens? What is happening to them?" Those people were not sent to death camps. They were sent elsewhere, and most of them survived.

(FATHER) NORBERT HOFFMANN: Pius XII did a lot for the Jewish people but behind the scenes. What he could do, he did. But he had to be cautious. It's a fact that during World War II, during the occupation here in Rome, a lot of Jewish people were saved and rescued. They were hidden in convents and monasteries, even the Vatican. The pope is the head of the Vatican, of the Catholic Church. The priests and nins wouldn't have done that

without the approval of Pius XII.

SISTER MARIA PASCALIZI (Convent of Santa Maria dei Sette Dolori in Rome): "During the war the nuns, on the advise, even if not under the orders, of the Holy Father Pius XII, opened their doors. They wanted to share the will of the Holy Father, who did so much to save our brethren.

MICAELA PAVONCELLO: My grandfather didn't get this invitation. Most of the Roman Jews had to find their ways, and they could have been warned. That would have been enough, trust me. This would have been enough.

My grandfather, who had at that time three children, they went to hide in a carpenter factory where my grandfather's brother had a job. The boss of this place, who was not Jewish, let them stay.

My great-grandmother, she was arrested in May '44. So she basically left Rome, I think, with the last train that ever arrived there in Poland. Then, when she arrived in Auschwitz, she was immediately gassed.

SISTER MARIA PASCALIZI: The SS entered the monastery, and they wanted to search the monastery. When the SS arrived, looking for Jews to deport, the convent was ruled by a very strong Mother Superior. She faced them with great courage, as if she had nothing to hide. Our brethren the Jews were saved.

SUSAN ZUCCOTTI: The story of Jews hiding in monasteries and convents and Catholic schools and Catholic hospitals is a very complicated one. There's been very little evidence of a papal role in the opening of these institutions. They were aware, and absolutely no question, that the pope had called for the need for sompassion for the victims of war. But he had not directed institution to open their doors.

(ACTOR VO) PRESIDENT ROOSEVELT, Letter to Pope Pius XII: "Your Holiness, the soldiers of the United Nations have come

to rid Italy of fascism, and of its unhappy symbols, and to drive out the Nazi oppressors who are infesting her. Churches and religious institutions will, to the extent that it is within our power, be spared the devastation of war during the struggle ahead. Cordially yours, Franklin Delanor Roosevelt."

DAVID KERTZER: The Nazis and the Italian Fascists were playing up the fact that while they protected the Church, the Allies were bombing monasteries, bombing churches, and potentially might bomb the Vatican itself.

MICAELA PAVONCELLO: The city of Rome was not bombed by the Nazis, so the agreement was respected. I don't see the Nazis respecting agreements anywhere else in Europe, but they did it in Rome. I feel that they felt the role of the Pope

MICHAEL PHAYER: We read all these dire threats on the part of the Vatican about, "Don't bomb us, don't bomb us!" and then you think, "Where is the threat about what's happening to the Jews?" So you weigh those two things, and the scales go like this.

BARCLAY TITTMANN: Watching the Americans and the British coming up Italy to liberate Rome; it was like hoping that your team will win. I can remember being terribly impatient that they were taking so much time.

My brother and I had very good cameras, which were available at bargain prices because of the war. So we could sit on the wall of our house and take pictures of the Germans leaving, and it was obvious who were the winners and who were the losers. The Germans didn't even have enough gas to pull their artillery. They had horses pulling their artillery. When the American came through in all their modern Jeeps and poweful trucks and so on, you definitely had a feeling that the war could not last much longer.

NEWSREEL VO: "His Holiness the Pope was about to speak, and

nearly half a million packed the historic square."

NEWSREEL, Pope Pius XII speaking Italian and translated: "Yesterday, Rome trembling for the lives of its sons and daughters, for the incomparable treasures of religion and of culture, condemning the eyes to the terrifying specter of war and unimaginable destruction, looks today with new hope and new faith toward its salvation."

NEWSREEL, Pope Pius XII speaking within the Sistine Chapel: "Dearly beloved sons, it is a real joy to welcome you all here. You know very well how our eternal heart has at times been almost overwhelmed by the sorrows of our children. You are those children, and we have prayed for you."

(FATHER) KEVIN SPICER: Even if nothing had happened, for Pius XII, in a very bold way; specific way; very clear way; had condemned the Holocaust using the word *Jew*, identifying the 6,000,000 who were murdered, what would that say today for Catholic-Jewish relations? What would that say today for the moral voice of the papacy?

(FATHER) NORBERT HOFFMANN: Maybe God in heaven will judge him at the end of his days, if he did the right thing. We didn't live in these times, these difficult times. Now, some years later or more we can speak very easily about his behavior. But we didn't experience this dangerous time here in Rome.

DAVID KERTZER: It has been said in defense of Pius XII and his silence during the Holocaust, "Well, what did the Americans or British do to help the Jews?" And, of course, we know that in the American case, the record is, in many ways, quite shameful in termas of not taking in Jewish refugees. The Americans and thr British, of course, did denounce the Nazis for what they wre doing to the Jews and spoke out about the absolute necessity of defeating the Nazis; and this, of course, the Pope never did. The Pope never denounced the Nazis for the massacre of the Jews

and never called for their defeat.

ROBERT VENTRESCA: We've just learned so much more about what was actually said, not said, what was actually don or not done, and I hope that we can finally come away from these really simplistic caricatures, either that he's Hitler's pope or he's a righteous gentile. So its important not to demonize him. But I think canonizing him, literally or figuratively, is another matter as well.

SUZANNE BROWN-FLEMMING: We all carve an honest, responsible, clear assessment of this history. For Jewish families trying to understand why, when they didn't desrve it, didn't do anything to earn the wrath of their neighbors and the Nazi regime and the silence of the Church in the face of that, and for Catholics who are asking themselves, "Why did my Church fail? Why did it fail the Jews? Why did it fail Catholic principles ultimately? Why did it fail to be a church of love and mercy?"

CAPTION: "Neutrality helps the oppressor, never the victim. Silence encourages the tormentor, never the tormented." —Elie Wiesel

CAPTION: Auschwitz, Poland July 2016. VIDEO: Pope Francis visiting Auschwitz with demonstrable contrition and humility.

CAPTION: "Their unspeakable suffering continues to cry out to humanity." —Pope Francis.

CAPTION: The Vatican's secret archives on Pope Pius XII open in March 2020. It will take years to review the millions of pages in the archives.

CAPTION: Pope Pius XII led the Catholic Church through the early years of the Cold War and resisted the spread of Communism in Europe and elsewhere. He died in 1958.

CAPTION: Father John LaFarge devoted the rest of his life to promoting racial justice in the United States. A few months before his death in 1963, he joined Martin Luther King Jr. for the historic March on Washington.

CAPTION: In 1965 the Catholic Church, under Pope Paul VI, officially rejected antisemitism in its *Nostra Aetate* declaration.